THE EARLIEST PICTORIAL REPRESENTATIONS
OF APE TALES

An Interdisciplinary Study of
Early Chinese Narrative Art and Literature*

BY

WU HUNG

(Harvard University)

In 1951, Richard Rudolph reported two pieces of bas-reliefs with similar pictorial representations in his well-known book, *Han Tomb Art of West China*. Five years later, the Chinese scholar, Wen Yu, published these works again with brief discussions of their subject matter. Both authors identified the provenance of the slabs as Xinjing in the Sichuan basin close to the Yangzi River. Rudolph described the pictorial scenes in a detailed figure-by-figure manner, but did not address their iconography; Wen Yu, on the other hand, mistakenly identified the representations as "ape-play," a kind of circus.

* I would like to thank Judith Zeitlin, a doctoral candidate in Chinese literature at Harvard University, for her suggestions concerning both the content and format of this study. I am also grateful to Wilma Fairbank who read the first draft of this paper and gave me many valuable comments.

It is necessary to define some terms which are used in a cross-disciplinary sense in this study. The following definitions are based on P. Hanan's and E. Panofsky's contentions, with minor modifications. "Plot" means the narrative development of a literary work in its entirety. Since this term implies a temporal sequence, when applied to visual art, it will be only used to describe cases where more than one pictorial scenes illustrate a given story. "Motif" means the subject-matter of visual representations. The term is also used in the same sense of "staff-material" as defined by Hanan: "the identifiable subject matter of a story regardless of its order and form." Again, following Hanan, "theme" denotes an abstraction from, or a generalization about, motifs. But in this study, it is often used in a more extended sense to mean a generalization about related literary and artistic motifs. "Composition," used specifically in describing art works, refers to the formal configuration of figures or individual scenes, while "pictorial complex" denotes the integration of a number of motifs according to their internal relationship of symbolic significance. cf., P. Hanan, The Chinese vernacular story, Cambridge (Mass.), 1981, p. 19–20; also E. Panofsky, Studies in iconology, New york, 1962, pp. 5–7.

1 R. Rudolph, *Han Tomb Art of West China*, Berkeley and Los Angeles, 1951, nos. 40–41.

2 Wen Yu, *Sichuan Han-dai Huaxiang Xuanji*, 1956, nos. 32, 46.
Two other pictorial representations resembling the Xinjing carvings can be found at other locations in Sichuan: one carved in a cave-tomb at Leshan 樂山, the other, on a stone coffin discovered in 1956 in Neijiang 内江. While the increasing discoveries of such carvings has demonstrated the popularity of the pictorial motif in this area during the Han, the subject matter of the representations still remains open to question. The only new iconographic explanation is that given by the excavator of the Neijiang coffin, who vaguely described the scene as “dancing and acting.”

In my opinion, the importance of studying the content of these carvings lies not only in supplying an interpretation of the iconography of these specific art works, but also in that it provides clues for speculating on some general problems regarding the interrelationship between early Chinese narrative literature and art. First, these carvings, in fact, represent an early version of the “White Ape” legend which later became the subject of the famous Tang short story, Bu Jiang Zong Bai-yun Zhuan (補江總白猿傳, A Supplement to Jiang Zong’s White Ape Tale). With their definite provenance and date, the carvings provide us with important evidence for tracing the origin and early development of this legend. Second, the “ape tale” motif and another motif, “Yang Youji 養由基 shooting a white ape,” co-exist in Sichuan pictorial art. These two motifs became two narrative “kernels” around which have developed two general themes of “ape” stories, (1) “a demonic ape abducting women” and (2) “the god Er-lang 二郎 defeating an ape spirit,” in post-Han literature and art.

---

3 This pictorial scene has been catalogued by Rudolf. See R. Rudolf, op. cit., no. 14.
4 Before 1958, there had been a debate among scholars regarding the function and the proper name of the “stone boxes” found in Sichuan. V. Segalen called them “sarcophagi”; Shang Chengzuo 商承祚 considered them containers of clothes and prized possessions of the deceased; He Changqun 賀昌群 argued that their proper name should be “shi-chuang” 石床 or “stone bed.” The latter opinion was further supported by Wen Yu. In 1958, Chinese archaeologists published the excavation report of the Han tomb in Tianhui Shan 天迴山, Sichuan. They reported that “remains of a skeleton, as well as other artifacts,” were found inside such stone boxes. This report proves that these boxes were used as coffins during the Han, and thus seems to clinch the argument. Cf., R. Rudolph, op. cit., p. 8; Wen Yu, op. cit., pp. 1–2; Shang Chengzuo. “Sichuan Xinjing dengdi Han yamu zhuannu kaolue” 四川新津等地漢崖墓祭祀考察, Jin-ting Daxue xue bao 金陵大學學報, vol. 10 (1940), pp. 1–18; Liu Zhiyuan 劉志遠, “Chengdu Tianhuisuan yamu qingli” 四川天迴山崖墓清理記, Kaogu Xuebao 考古學報, 1958, 1, p. 87–103.
6 Ibid., p. 54.
1. The Four Carvings and the White Ape Tale

Among the four carvings cited above, the two from Xinjing are fragments of stone coffins.7 The piece illustrated in Fig. 2 shows a complete composition (hereafter, Scene B), 63.5 cm in width and 205 cm in length. The other slab is broken; five surviving fragments have been pieced together, presenting a composition whose left end is evidently missing (Fig. 1; hereafter, Scene A).

Four highly animated figures are represented in Scene A. On the left, close to the broken edge remains a portion of a mountain with a zigzag outline. An animal-like creature with bare arms and legs is running towards the mountain. Although some damage to its face obscures the identity of the creature, this problem can be resolved by the close resemblance between this figure and a gibbon or orangutan carved in juxtaposition in Scene B (Fig. 2). The animal in Scene A carries another figure on its back, who wears a gown with long sleeves concealing both hands. As in many Han carvings from Sichuan, this costume style particularly depicts female figures. In the picture, this woman and her captor both seem alarmed. The woman turns her head back; her mouth opens as if she is crying out for help. The ape is in flight, while turning its body half-way back and stretching its arms violently to resist the attack from behind. The attackers are two men; both wear wide robes and hold swords in their right hands. The one immediately following the ape is striking a deadly blow; his gesture resembles that of a lunging fencer. The other man behind him is also in pursuit, holding a horizontal object with diagonal stripes—probably some kind of bamboo-plaited basket used in hunting.

Fig. 1, Scene A (reprinted from Wen Yu (1956), pl. 32)

7 According to Wen Yu, all coffins found at Xinjing before 1949 had been cut into pieces by antique-merchants who then sold them in Chengdu. Wen Yu, op. cit., interpretation of fig. ding.
Scene B bears striking resemblance to Scene A. Important changes in both the representation of individual figures and the whole narrative sequence, however, are also evident. The artist of this work seems more interested in distinguishing the status and roles of the two attackers. In contrast to the major attacker who wears a cap and a long gown, indicating his superior position, the man behind him wears a short and narrow robe exposing his legs. This shows clearly that the second man is merely an attendant who carries hunting equipment and follows his master, —who is the hero in the confrontation with the animal. The ape (or monkey), instead of carrying a woman and fleeing, is isolated in front of the mountain, and is being attacked by the master who is thrusting the sword at its left eye. The ape’s dramatic gestures express a last-ditch struggle. The woman, whose identity in this case is more clearly represented by her hair and costume style, is seated in a peach-shaped cave watching the action.

The carvings from Leshan and Neijiang are rather crude versions of the two Xinjing pictures, but with some significant variations. The story carved on the Neijiang coffin (Fig.3; hereafter, Scene C) resembles Scene A, showing the ape (whose naked body has a short tail) fleeing from the men’s attack. An important difference, or com-
lement, is that this carving represents the ape running towards an elaborate house in which two figures (women?) are seated in the traditional manner, facing each other and perhaps chatting or drinking. As mentioned above, the left end of Scene A is missing. According to Xin Lixiang, all of Sichuan stone coffins are about 220 cm in length. The surviving part of Scene A is 170 cm long; the length of the missing section should be about 50 cm, more than one fifth of the original composition. It is reasonable to assume that certain other images adorned this section, and that we may derive an idea about the missing pictures from the Neijiang carving.

The images in the Leshan carving (Fig.4; hereafter, Scene D) are especially obscure because they were carved in an exposed place in a cave-tomb and suffered severely from the elements. The composition of this carving is identical with that of Scene B from Xinjing. The woman, in this case, is depicted as leaning forward from the cave and stretching her arms towards either the men or the ape. The latter has been struck to the ground. Turning its head back and crying, the animal seems reluctant to lose its life and mountain home. The master, wearing a tall headdress, adopts a fencing gesture similar to the image in Scene B. His follower, however, is represented rather grotesquely, with a huge head and body.

Clearly, these four scenes share a single motif: an ape abducts a woman and is then pursued and killed by two men. The artists of these works, however, chose different episodes of the narrative to represent the central motif. Slab A focuses on the woman’s kidnapping by the ape and the men’s pursuit; Slab C, in addition to the part represented in Scene A, shows the ape’s mountain home in which it keeps its concubines (?); Scenes B and D, on the other hand, depict the killing scene after the animal has settled the captive woman in its mountain cave. In fact, these pictorial scenes represent different stages of a narrative plot, which we will understand better from the following discussion about their literary reference. It is noteworthy that these carvings were clearly made by different hands;

![Fig.4, Scene D (reprinted from R. Rudolph (1951), pl.14)](image)

---

8 Xin Lixiang, *Han huaxiangshi de fenqi he fenqu* 漢畫像石的分期和分區, master’s thesis at Beijing University, 1982, p. 63.
each exhibits markedly distinct stylistic and technical features. Yet, they possess a very similar pictorial format. Considering that Han pictorial scenes on bas-reliefs were often copied from copybooks, it is possible that these carvings share a common source. This source, in turn, might contain more than one illustration of the whole narrative. To my knowledge, this is the earliest evidence which may suggest the existence of such “picture-stories” during the Han.

Two passages related to these “ape tale” carvings can be found in texts dating from the first to fourth centuries A.D. The first is from the Yi Lin (易林, Forest of the Changes), a first century commentary of the Changes. Under bo 割 in the section “Kun” 坤 are the lines:

A great ape from the southern mountains
Robbed me of my beloved wife.
For fear, I dared not chase him.
I could but retire, to dwell alone.

The second reference appears in both Zhang Hua’s 張華 Bo Wu Zhi (博物志, Encyclopedic Records of Things, c.290) and the Sou Shen Ji (搜神記, Records of Spirits, c.340), a collection of marvels ascribed to Gan Bao 千寶:

In the high mountains of southwestern Shu there is an animal resembling the monkey. It is seven feet in height, it can imitate the ways of human beings and is able to run fast in pursuit of them. It is named Jia-guo 猴國 or Ma-hua 馬化; some call it Jue 越. It watches out for young women travelling on the road and

---

9 For example, the “Bibliography” chapter in the History of the Former Han lists a book entitled Method for Painting Confucius and his Disciples. Ban Gu 袁固, Han Shu 袁書, Beijing, p. 1962, p. 1717. cf., Martin Powers, “Pictorial art and its public in early imperial China”, Art History, vol. 7, no. 2 (June 1984), p. 141. The existence of such copybooks during the Han can be proved, in fact, by Han carvings themselves which are characterized by great repetition of motifs and compositions.

seizes and bears them away without anyone being aware of it. If travellers are
due to pass in its vicinity they lead one another by a long robe, but even this fails
to avert disaster. The beast is able to distinguish between the smell of men and
women and can thus pick out the women and leave the men. Having abducted
a man's wife or daughter it makes her its own wife. Women that fail to bear its
children can never return for the rest of their lives, and after ten years they come
to resemble the beast in appearance, their minds become confused, and they no
longer think of return. Those that bear sons return to their homes with the infants
in their arms. The sons are all like men in appearance. If any refuse to rear them.
the mothers die. So the women go in fear of the beast, and none dares refuse to
bring up her son. Grown up, the sons are no different from men, and they all take
the surname Yang 楊, which is why there are so many people by that name now
in the south west of Shu: they are mostly descended from the Jia-guo or Ma-hua.11

K. Dewoskin has argued that a distinct structural schema of
Han-type narratives is to organize curious items along geographical
lines.12 In this tradition, “anomalous” stories and phenomena are
firmly associated with distant places unfamiliar to people who lived
in the central China.13 The above two early textual references of
the ape tale clearly fall into this category. According to the Yi Lin,
the ape-demon lived in “southern mountains;” the other passage
states even more definitely that the strange event occurred “in the
high mountains of southwestern Shu.” Such geographical elements
have led some scholars to infer that the ape tale must have origin-
ated in the Southwest, say, Sichuan or Tibet.14 However, one should
note that a logical gap remains between the evidence and their
conclusions: a geographical setting of a story does not necessarily
imply the origin of the story; a fictionalized event might be invented
by story tellers motivated by their curiosity about an alien culture.
As Dewoskin assets, “Bringing order and permanence to the sub-
stance of a barbarian culture must be counted as a major desire
motivating the zhi-guai 志怪 writers.”15

11 Gan Bao, Sou Shen Ji, Beijing, 1959, p. 152; translated by G. Dudbridge, op.
cit., pp. 115–6. (Since the present paper adopts the pinyin system in transliterating
Chinese characters, hereafter I replace the transliteration of other systems in
cited English translations with pinyin spellings). The passage in the Bo Wu Zhi is
almost identical. cf., Fan Ning 范寧, Bo Wu Zhi jiaozheng 博物志校正, Beijing,
1980, p. 36. For minor differences between these two references, see Dudbridge,
p. 116, note. 1.
12 K.J. Dewoskin, “The Six Dynasties chih-kuai and the birth of fiction,” in
13 Cf., Ibid., p. 38; Wu Hung, “A Sanpan Shan chariot ornament and the
xiangrui design in Western Han art”, Archives of Asian Art, vol. 37, 1984, pp. 46–7.
monograph III, Beijing, 1942, pp. 27–9; also cf., Dudbridge’s discussion in op.
cit., p. 116.
15 K.J. Dewoskin, op. cit., p. 38.
The four pictorial carvings discussed above provide us with the most solid evidence to substantiate the contention that the ape tale was originally an indigenous Sichuan legend during the Han. This confirmation is based on two interrelated facts: first, the four carvings were all created in the area, and second, the ape's story illustrated in these works was exclusively a Sichuan pictorial motif.

The origins of Scenes C and D are definite. As mentioned earlier, Scene C is carved on a stone coffin excavated from a tomb at Neijiang. Scene D was found on a wall of Cave-tomb No. 3 at Leshan; the tomb has been carefully investigated, photographed and reported by V. Segalen and other archaeologists. On the other hand, although no direct archaeological evidence supports Rudolph's and Wen Yu's contention that Scenes A and B were from Xinjing, this report is also convincing. Archaeological studies have proved that the stone coffins, from which the two carvings were broken off, represent a type of burial equipment which only existed in Sichuan during the Han. Moreover, a distinct artistic style and carving technique closely associate these two carvings with a considerable number of Xinjing coffin-carvings. Highly animated, long-bodied figures and a conspicuous cross-hatch background are two major characteristics of Xinjing bas-reliefs, which differ markedly from other regional styles within or outside Sichuan. Geographically speaking, Leshan, Neijiang, and Xinjing—the three locations of the "ape-tale" carvings—form three points of a triangular area, with each side covering about sixty miles, in the heart of the Chengdu basin. Again, among thousands of Han bas-reliefs which have been found in different regions in China, the four scenes from this area are the only examples depicting the ape story. All of these facts indicate that the ape-tale was a strictly indigenous pictorial motif which enjoyed popularity only in the Chengdu area at the time.

People have generally dated Sichuan bas-reliefs, including the

---


17 More than twenty stone coffins decorated with pictorial scenes have been found in China. Except for one from Yunnan province, all were discovered in Sichuan. cf., Xin Lixiang, op. cit., p. 64.

18 For similar coffin-carvings found in Xinjing, see R. Rudolf, op. cit. Pl. 37–41, 46–59.

19 Monkey images are commonly seen on stone bas-reliefs from other regions of China. One can find reproductions of such images in K. Finsterbusch's Verzeichnis und motivindex der Han-darstellungen, Otto Harrassowitz, Wiesbaden, 1966, nos. 163, 286, 545, 563, 564, 594, 921. Most of these images, however, are represented as auspicious animals climbing onto elaborate buildings. None are depicted in a narrative composition as in the four "ape tale" scenes from Sichuan.
four ape-tale carvings to the Han period. For our aim, which is to trace the origin of the ape legend, it is necessary to assign a more precise date to these works. Fortunately, archaeological studies provide us with sufficient evidence. The tomb no. 3 at Leshan, where Scene D was depicted, is one of thousands of cave-tombs found in Sichuan. Along the Yangzi River from the Hubei border across Sichuan to the foot of the Tibetan highlands, in the Jialing 嘉陵 valley from Chongqing 重慶 up to the southern slope of the Qinling 秦嶺 mountains, and especially at Leshan and Xinjing in the Min 峨眉 valley, numerous cave-tombs are cut in the solid rock on the face of the precipices.20 According to Cheng Te-k’un, these cave-tombs evolved from brick tombs, representing a new burial custom which gradually gained popularity during the second half of the first century A.D. and finally became dominant in the second century A.D.21 A series of dates, found either on cave-walls or on tomb-bricks, as well as on coins and other objects have proved Cheng’s contention.22 Furthermore, tomb No.3 belongs to a group of the largest and most ornate cave-tombs. Built in the Min valley, they penetrate the cliff to a depth of almost thirty meters. Their huge size, advanced structure and elaborate decoration represent the zenith of Sichuan cave art and architecture, and have led scholars to conclude that they must have been constructed in a comparatively later period, about the second half of the second century A.D.23


21 Cheng Te-k’un, op. cit, p. 147.

22 Hong Gua 洪 cade of the Song dynasty recorded a seventy-four-character inscription, dated 77 A.D., from a cliff tomb in Sichuan. Hong Gua, Li Shi 鐘時, vol. 13, pp. 9–10, in Shi ke shiliao xinbian 石刻史料新編, Taipei, 1976, reprint 1982, vol. 9, p. 6898. The location, shape and decoration of this tomb, however, are no longer known. Other dates, found on cave-walls and tomb-bricks, have been reported by Chang Renxia, Shang Chengzuo, Cheng Te-k’un, and Xin Lixiang. These dates include: 102, 128, 134, 158, 162, 175, 176, 172–177 and 181 A.D. cf., Chang Renxia, op. cit, pp. 9–11; Shang Chengzuo, op. cit; W. Franke, “Die Han Zeittlichen Felsengräber bei Chia-tung,” Studia Serica, vol. 7 (1948), pp. 185–201, Cheng Te-k’un, op. cit, p. 147; Xin Lixiang, op. cit, p. 63.

23 Xin Lixiang, op. cit, p. 63.
Unlike Scene D which appears in a cave-tomb, Scenes A, B, and C are all carved on stone coffins. A large majority of coffins found in Sichuan are made of wood or clay; the elaborate ones, however, are those of red sandstone. According to Chinese archaeologists’ reports, more than twenty stone coffins are “pictorial” that is, carved with ornaments and narrative scenes on the surface. Xin Lixiang 信立祥, in his exhaustive study of Han pictorial art, periodized these “pictorial” coffins into two developmental stages according to their different technical and stylistic features. In the earlier stage, decorative motifs are limited and simple, completely lacking narrative representation. Evidence concerning the date of this stage has been obtained from dated objects accompanying the coffins, including an inscribed bronze mirror and tomb-bricks. Such evidence indicates a middle Eastern Han date, from about the end of the first century A.D. to the first half of the second century A.D.

Coffins belonging to the second stage exhibit a far more complicated and sophisticated decorative style in terms of both thematic richness and artistic excellence. Although quality of carvings varies greatly due to different achievement of artisans, works belonging to this period show a common tendency to derive motifs from a large variety of sources and to compose them into a coherent pictorial complex. The best works of this period, exemplified by those from Xinjing, evidence the flourish of Sichuan pictorial art, and substantiate Pelliot’s contention that “Han sculpture in Sichuan has quite a different character from what it has in Shandong; it is more spontaneous and more alive. . . .” Apparently, this style developed from the carvings belonging to the first stage. Xin Lixiang provides further archaeological evidence needed to clinch the late Eastern Han date of this stage—a golden inlaid bronze knife of 184 A.D. and late Eastern Han coins were found together with these elaborately decorated coffins.

All of the four “ape tale” scenes belong to the second stage in the development of “pictorial” coffins. They all originated from the central area of Sichuan during the late Eastern Han, about the second half of the second century A.D. Although this conclusion does not reveal the emergence and early formation of the legend itself

---

24 Coffins belonging to the first developmental stage are exemplified by a coffin discovered in Yibin, Sichuan. see Wu Zhongshi 吴仲宙, “Sichuan Yibin Han-mu qingli hengduo chutu wenwu” 四川宜宾漢墓清理很多出土文物, Wenwu Cankao Ciltiao 文物参考资料, 1954 12, p. 190.
25 Cf., Xin Lixiang, op. cit, p. 65.
26 from a passage quoted by R. Rudolph, op. cit, p. 17.
27 Xin Lixiang, op. cit, p. 65.
from folklore; it does prove that in this particular region and period the ape legend had developed into a well-formulated narrative composition in popular art.

The common theme of an ape seizing women has led us to relate the pictorial representations with the literary reference cited above. Ironically, the pictures show a more developed plot than the early textual sources. Both literary passages repeat a single motif—supernatural monkeys seizing women, and lack further development of the event. Moreover, the overall tone of both passages is rather pessimistic; there is not any suggestion of people successfully resisting the apes' demonic will. The four pictorial carvings, on the other hand, clearly demonstrate a narrative structure, consisting of four coherent episodes: the ape seizes women and hides them in its mountain dwelling; the ape abducts an individual woman and makes her his concubine; the men pursue and, finally, kill the ape. It is this structure that became the core of the "Tale of the White Ape" of the Tang dynasty.28

The Tang tale is a prose fiction consisting of four coherent sections of almost equal length. The first three constitute the body of the ape story; the development of the event parallels that shown in the Sichuan pictorial representations.

The first section relates that a beautiful woman was mysteriously missing. A certain Ouyang He 歐陽緒, a general in a government army, was sent to the southern frontier on a campaign. One night, his wife was spirited away from a locked room at the heart of the army encampment; no trace of her could be found.

This tragic event is immediately followed by the husband's search. Grief-stricken, Ouyang swore that he would not leave the region until he had found his wife. He forded rivers and climbed mountains in search of her, but it was fruitless until one day he found an embroidered shoe belonging to his wife. With his armed soldiers he continued the search and finally entered a heavily wooded area. They found a mysterious garden on a sheer cliff; more than a score of women played inside. The women told him that they had all been abducted there by a white ape, and that his wife was sick in a cave.

Following the discovery of the ape's residence is the episode of slaying the demonic animal. The captive women taught Ouyang the method and disclosed the ape's secret weakness. As instructed, Ouyang brought the women dogs—the ape's favorite food—and the strongest liquor which he could find. The ape, transmuted into the shape of

28 The story was translated by Chi-chen Wang in Traditional Chinese Tales, New York, 1944, pp. 12–16.
a handsome bearded man, ate and drank till it fell down dead drunk. Bound by the women, it returned to its natural shape. Ouyang and his men all struck the ape, but weapons were useless on its iron body. Only when they succeeded in striking a blow at the secret spot a few inches under the navel, did the blade penetrate and kill the demon.

It is not difficult to find close parallels in the narrative sequence between this story and the pictorial carvings. One important difference, however, is that in the early versions of the story as represented by the Sichuan pictures and the two literary sources, the captive women are totally passive. But in the Tang version they play a crucial role in destroying the ape. In the final section of the Tang story, the importance of the captive women becomes even more evident; they become the narrators of the story, and reveal a very different image of the ape. The creature is described as resembling a Taoist immortal or a swordsman. He lived in seclusion in the mountains and read “slips of wood inscribed in a seal-script like that used on Taoist charms, completely unintelligible.” He “danced with his swords, which he swung so rapidly that they flashed around him like lightning.” This new image is reinforced by the ape’s awareness of the heavenly mandate. According to the women’s report, the ape had said earlier “I have lived a thousand years without siring a son. Now I am about to have one. The term of my life has come.” Most surprisingly, this image is again combined with certain Confucian worldly ideas: the ape predicted in its dying words that its son borne by Ouyang’s wife would “come before the Sage Emperor and bring honour to his ancestors.”

Uchiyama Chinari has pointed out the inconsistency of the ape’s personality,29 and G. Dudbridge noted that in the last section the ape’s new characteristics, “in their turn inspired by precedents in supernatural legends, attach themselves to the traditional ape figure in this fictional treatment, yet they leave the ape’s central motivation, the starting point of the whole story, clear and intact.”30 The pictorial story suggests that the first three sections of the Tang tale were based on the traditional narrative plot which can be dated as early as late second century A.D., and that the final part is a later addition. In order to create a “new” ape appealing to contemporary taste, the anonymous Tang author expanded the role of the captive women to narrate the ape’s “embellished” characteristics, and

30 G. Dudbridge, op. cit, pp. 117-8.
changed the story from a straightforward development to a flashback.

2. The Ape-demon and the Divine archer

The above discussion is primarily concerned with the iconography, i.e., the identification of literary sources, of pictorial carvings. On closer look, however, further questions soon emerge which have puzzled students of Han art: Why were a number of motifs especially favored by people of the Han? How can we explain the meanings of these motifs in a ritual context? What is the relationship between individual motifs derived from various sources but composed in a single pictorial complex? These questions have been the focus of the study of Han pictorial art during recent years. In their pursuit, art historians have gradually developed the notion that these questions could be answered only by comprehending the structure of a whole pictorial complex, or as some art historian have called it, a pictorial program. It is the larger pictorial composition, rather than individual motifs, which is linked directly with the ritual context, and thus gives additional meaning to the motifs.

Taking a pictorial coffin as an example, various stories, including the ape tale, depicted on such a funerary stone box follow a structural rule: the celestial scenes on the top, the entrance of the soul and symbols of the universe on the two end walls, and scenes representing the entertainment of the deceased, the protection of the soul, and the Taoist transcendent world on the side walls. Therefore, when a story was transformed from a written or oral tradition into carvings on stone coffins, both its narrative form and meaning changed; an individual pictorial scene became meaningful on two different levels. The first is its iconographic or literary meaning; the second, the


32 Wilma Fairbank expressed this idea forty-five years ago: "The interrelationships and positional significance of the engraved stones is lost when they are studied as scattered slabs or rubbings. A grasp of this positional significance will be shown to illuminate subject matter at present obscure." W. Fairbank, "The offering shrines of 'Wu Liang tz'u,'" *Harvard Journal of Asiatic Studies*, vol. 6, no. 1, p. 3. P. Berger expressed a similar idea in her dissertation. Cf. P. Berger, *Rites and festivities in the art of Eastern Han China*, Ph.D. dissertation, University Microfilm International, Ann Arbor, p. 179. I have discussed this development of scholarship in the study of the Eastern Han carvings in an unpublished article, "The Wu family shrines: one thousand years of scholarship," Chapter 2, Section 3: "Study of the Wu family shrines in modern scholarship."

symbolic or ritual meaning. On the first level, a scene is telling the story. Due to the fixed nature of bas-relief, the temporal development of a narrative sequence is largely eliminated; the story is represented by a specific dramatic moment and depends on the viewer to reconstruct the original "literary" plot. An understanding of the plot, in turn, leads the viewer to comprehend the ritual meaning of the picture. On this level, individual motifs exist as reminders of certain general ideas, and each can be replaced by other motifs belonging to the same category and still keep the whole structure intact. In this symbolic structure, a narrative episode is cut off from its original literary or oral context, and becomes an element of a new pictorial cycle. Together with other motifs from different sources, they transform a plain funerary box into a universe, a paradise, a temple, or a banquet hall where the deceased would enjoy himself in another life.

Our understanding of the "ape tale" scenes can be re-examined and deepened by applying this interpretive scheme. By identifying the story represented in the carvings with the literary references, we have comprehended the iconographic features of the pictures as individual compositions and know what these pictures narrate. The structural analysis of the coffin-carvings shows, however, that these scenes are not only "self-contained" compositions; they are also compositional elements of larger pictorial representations. Their significance, therefore, can be understood in a different light when we consider that they were consciously designed to meet the ritual purpose of a funerary device. On this level of interpretation, the "ape tale" carvings are firmly related to a traditional motif of "demon quelling" or "soul protection."

The basic ritual implication of this motif is clear. People always longed to enter the land of immortality after death; nevertheless, death represents a stage beyond lived experience and constantly creates fears. The darkness where the deceased would enter might be full of harmful ghosts, spirits, and animals, or the soul might encounter great dangers on his journey to the immortal paradise. Such fears had become the central motivation of various shamanistic practices which aimed to guide or to protect the soul in a world unknown. Before the idea of a transcendent paradise had been fully developed, a happy conclusion to the soul's story might simply be to return to its homeland. The concrete expression of such a belief may be found in "Zhao Hun" (招魂, Soul Recalling) and "Da Zhao" (大招, Great Recalling) in the Songs of the South. These two

---

34 Cf., E. Panofsky, op. cit., "Introductory".
poems, or shamanistic prayers, were created during the Eastern Zhou. The idea of immortality had emerged during this period, but it was assumed that the transcendent stage could be reached only through arduous self-cultivation or by the costly discovery of an overseas immortal land during one's lifetime.

The two trends—the ideas of a “happy homeland” and of immortality—were amalgamated in popular Han beliefs dealing with the problem of death. On the one hand, people were now convinced that immortality was not the exclusive pursuit of philosophers or emperors who possessed great intelligence or wealth. Immortality could also be achieved by an ordinary person, whose soul would enter some distant land, say, the Three Islands of the Blessed or the realm of the Queen Mother of the West, where it could enjoy happiness greater than in its earthly home. This is why so many pictures portraying the Queen Mother's domain were depicted all over the country during the Han, in tombs and offering shrines, and on coffins and funerary banners.

On the other hand, although it seems contradictory, the old belief of a “happy homeland” was still deeply-rooted. The world of a deceased was considered, in essence, as an extension of his former life and, more importantly, as the ideal model of the human world. Death would permit the deceased to enjoy that which he had not been so lucky to experience during his lifetime: he would live in elaborate halls served by numerous attendants, and would taste delicacies while amused by colorful performances. Death would also realize an ideal society, directed and perfectly regulated by the highest social and moral values exemplified by Confucian teachings. All of these desires were pictures in funerary art. However, these hopes would be impossible to realize unless the soul and the corpse were carefully protected from damages inflicted by natural processes or by evil forces. As a result, funeral structures were intended to be the longest lasting of all architecture. Towards the Eastern Han, more and more tombs were built purely of stone, and coffins provided further protection for corpses. In addition to such physical protection, ritual or shamanistic activities guarded the soul against evil influences. Charms were inscribed, and “warding-off evil” pictures were painted or carved inside tombs. In Sichuan tomb decor, we see images of tigers whose function—“to destroy evil” and “to ward off harm”—is indicated by accompanying inscrip-

---

35 Cf., E. Chavannes, *Six Monuments de la sculpture Chinoise*, Paris, 1914, pl. 3. A phrase, “ji-ji-ru-lu-ling” 急急如律令, is inscribed on the pictorial slab published by Chavannes. This is perhaps the earliest appearance of this expression which later became the conventional phrase in Taoist charms.
tions. We also find guardian figures cocking cross-bows, or grasping snakes which were traditionally believed to be evil creatures found underground.

Interestingly, a considerable number of “demonic” creatures in Sichuan funerary carvings are monkeys or apes being attacked by either humans or dogs. There was a strong belief in Sichuan during the Han that dogs had power to protect the deceased against evil forces including demonic monkeys, and their images were often carved inside tombs. A scene on the lintel in a cave-tomb at Shizwan, Leshan, shows a pair of dogs of enormous size gazing at two monkeys; the latter seem powerless as they fall headlong to the ground (Fig.5). In the same vein, we find in literary works that monkeys were considered as embodying evil and carrying diseases, and that dogs possessed a special ability to overcome such demonic creatures:

The mother of a Protector of the Army, Zhang Zhao, fell ill. Chunyu Zhi made a divination by stalks [to learn the method to heal the disease]. He then instructed the lady to go west to the market, with a monkey tied on her arms. He also ordered people to hold and strike the monkey, letting it cry out incessantly. After three days and three nights, he released the animal, which ran out the door and was immediately killed by a dog. From this moment Zhang Zhao’s mother gradually recovered.

This story was widespread during the Jin, and appears repeatedly in literary and historical works, such as Gan Bao’s Sou Shen Ji and two versions of the “History of the Jin Dynasty.” Similar beliefs,
however, had already become popular during the Eastern Han. We read in Wang Chong’s *Lun Heng* his denunciation of a common “superstition” that “dogs can overcome monkeys.”41

While the carving in the Shiziwan tomb merely shows a simple configuration of monkeys and dogs, the motif of quelling demonic apes is expressed more explicitly in depicting of more complicated narratives. The “ape tale” scenes discussed in the first section of this paper are excellent examples. The four pictorial representations of the story all focus on the episode of the men slaying the ape. Again, we find in Sichuan funerary carvings another scene which embodies the same symbolic meaning of “demon-quelling” and takes the subject matter from a story of the legendary archer, Yang Youji, shooting a white ape.

This scene appears on a stone pillar erected in front of the mound of an Eastern Han official called Shen 沈 in Quxian 渠縣, Sichuan. On the shafts of the monuments appear symbolic animals—the Red Bird, the Blue Dragon and the White Tiger—and at the corners of the frieze are seated men who carry the projecting eaves on their shoulders. Close to the roof is a scene which is particularly relevant to our discussion. As shown in Fig.6, this scene represents an archer

---

in violent movement, drawing his bow powerfully about to shoot. His target is a monkey or an ape. The animal is in a state of great fear. Clinging onto a bracket of the roof helplessly with its fore-legs and looking down upon the archer, it seems to be hoping to hide itself.

The earliest literary source of this pictorial composition appears in the *Lü Shi Chun Qiu* 呂氏春秋 of the third century B.C.:

Once in the palace of Jing 嘉 there was a supernatural white ape. Even the skillful archers of Jing could not hit it. Then the king of Jing asked [the archer of legendary fame] Yang Youji to shoot it. Yang straightened his bow and went to the palace with arrows in his hands. Before shooting he aimed at a place where the [moving] ape had not yet arrived. When he let the arrow fly, the ape fell immediately. Thus Yang Youji could be called the archer who could hit a target before it was there.42

This story reappears in the *Huainan-zi* of Western Han, with some significant modifications:

A king of Chu 楚 had a white ape. When the king himself shot at it the animal caught the arrow and played with it. When the king had Yang Youji shoot the ape, however, it embraced a column and wailed as soon as Yang put the arrow to the string, even before shooting.43

Comparing these two passages, the earlier one emphasizes Yang Youji’s great skill in archery, while the later version takes the ape as the central character and focuses on the dramatic change in the ape’s attitude. It is significant to note that in the Han passage the ape is described as “embracing a column” when it encounters the famous archer—an episode which can be visualized in the carving on the Shen pillar.

Many lines of evidence demonstrate the popularity of this story in the historical periods following the Western Han. It appears in Ban Gu’s 班固 rhapsody, “You Tong Fu” 幽通賦, of the Eastern Han, in Gan Bao’s *Sou Shen Ji* of the Six Dynasties, and so on.44 The pictorial representations further suggest that it was known to people

---

living in Sichuan during the Eastern Han. When this story spread to Sichuan, however, it was adopted as a ready-made vehicle on which to superimpose the indigenous motif of “ape-quelling,” and was depicted in funerary art to express the desire for “soul-protection.”

This renewed ritual significance of the motif was further reinforced by a strong traditional belief in ancient China that archery possessed certain magical power capable of overcoming evil forces. Many examples related to this tradition can be found in ancient historical, ritual, and literary writings. It is said when King Zhou of the Shang attempted to battle with a supernatural being, he ordered people to hang up a leather bag containing blood and shot it.

During the Western Zhou, whenever a feudal lord disobeyed the order of the central government, the Zhou king would shoot a special target in the capital to ward off the lord’s evil will. Down to the Eastern Zhou, officers entitled Ting-shi were in charge of quelling “demonic” birds and of warding off evil omens which they signified by shooting them with special bows and arrows. Again, the most famous “demon quellers” in Chinese legends, such as Yi, Yang Youji, and Erlang Shen, are always extraordinary archers.

This last instance of the archery symbolism further explains why when the story, “Yang Youji shooting the white ape,” was transformed from literature into art, its pictorial composition was actually based on another scene, “Yi shooting false suns,” which is well known in Eastern Han funerary art.

An example of the latter motif can be found on the coffin from Baozi Shan, Xinjing. As illustrated in Fig.7, the composition is centered on a great tree. A pair of large, elaborate birds rest on the two main branches in a symmetrical fashion, while smaller birds are scattered around. Below, an archer draws his bow and aims at one of the birds. A simplified form of this scene can be observed on a lintel in a cave-tomb at Leshan, representing an archer who raises his bow about to shoot a huge bird (Fig.8). As scholars have suggested, these scenes represent the story of Yi shooting down nine false suns—a legendary event which was considered the greatest deed of the

---

45 Sima Qian, Shi ji, “Yin Ben Ji” 舊本記, Shanghai, 1932, p. 58. A similar story is recorded in the Lü Shi Chun Qiu, cf., Xu Weiju, op. cit., p. 1085.

46 References to this ritual can be found in the “Feng Chan Shu” 封禪書 chapter in Sima Qian’s Shi ji, in the “Jiao Su Zhi” 郡佐志 chapter in Ban Gu’s Han Shu, in the “Xiang She” 襄她 chapter in Bai Hu tong 白虎通, and so on. cf., Yang Kuan 楊寬, Gushi xintan 古史新探, Beijing, 1965, pp. 334–337.

divine archer. According to legend, after a series of victories Yi went to the East where he discovered that on a gigantic fu-sang tree, ten golden birds were blowing fire and thereby forming ten suns whose heat burnt up all living creatures. He shot nine arrows in succession and struck the birds; the nine additional suns immediately turned into red clouds and melted away.\textsuperscript{48}

It is not difficult to see the close formal resemblance between the archers' image in the "shooting ape" scene and Yi's image in the "sunbirds shooting" motif. The target of the archer in the former, however, has been altered; it is no longer the false suns, but an ape. The compositional arrangement of these two motifs also resemble each other. One shows birds flying above a tree; the other shows the ape climbing onto a roof-bracket or a beam. Both compositional arrangements provided artists with opportunities to represent the archers raising their bows to shoot the objects above—Yi's standard gesture in Eastern Han art.

\textsuperscript{48} The story is recorded in the "Ben Jing Xun" 本經訓 chapter in \textit{Huainan-zi}, and in the "Zhao Hun" and "Tian Wen" 天問 in \textit{Chu Ci} 楚辭 attributed to Qu Yuan 屈原. cf., Yuan Ke 袁珂, \textit{Zhongguo gutai shenhua} 中國古代神話, Shanghai, 1957, pp. 173–186.
Interestingly, we find a similar parallelism between Yang Youji and Yi in literature. A sentence appears twice in the *Yi Lin*: "As Yi is drawing his bow, the birds wail," while Guo Pu 郭璞 wrote in the *Shang Hai Jing tuzan* 山海經圖譜: "As Yang Youji is drawing his bow, the white ape gazes [at him] and wails." The two expressions share a common sentence structure even including the word "hao" (號, to wail).

The "ape shooting" motif, therefore, stems from two known sources. One is a literary source, "Yang Youji shooting the white ape," which provided the subject matter; the other is a pictorial source, "Yi shooting the sunbirds," which provided a compositional formula. The reason behind this integration is easy to understand. Both Yi and Yang Youji were legendary archers; and both of them were well-known "demon-quellers."

The scene showing an archer (either Yang Youji or Yi) defeating an ape represents the second of two "ape" motifs in Sichuan art. The first is the "ape abducting women" motif discussed in the first section of the present paper. Although these two motifs expressed similar symbolic meanings in funerary contexts, they are distinguished from each other on an iconographical level as they derive from different literary sources. These two motifs then became "kernels" around which two large categories of ape stories in post-Han literature and art have developed.

In the stories belonging to the first category, the essential role of the ape is as an abductor of women. We find this basic theme in Gan Bao’s *Sou Shen ji* and Zhang Hua’s *Bo Wu Zhi* of the Six Dynasties, in the "White Ape Tale" of the Tang, in the story "Laoyuan qie furen" (老猿窃婦人, An old ape seized women) in Xu Xuan’s 徐巖 Ji Shen Lu 錫神錄 of the Song, in the play "Shi zhenren si-sheng suo baiyuan" (時真人四聖鎖白猿, The Taoist protector Shi locks up a white ape) of the Yuan or early Ming, and in the vernacular stories, such as "Shen yang Tong Ji" (申陽洞記, The story

---


50 This story is quoted by Zeng Yao 曾 occas in *Lei Shuo* 類說; it does not appear in the present version of *Ji Shen Lu*. Zeng Yao, *Lei Shuo*, Beijing, 1955, vol. 1, pp. 826–827.

of Shenyang Cave), "Chen xunjian Meiling shiqi" (Officer Chen lost his wife at the Plum Mountain) and "Yanguanyi laomo meise; Huihaishan dashi zhume" (An old demon seducing beauties; on Huihai Mountain the Bodhisattva Guan-yin punishing the evil spirit) of the Ming. As suggested in the first section of this paper, the most advanced pre-Tang version of this category can be seen in the four "ape tale" carvings from Sichuan.

Works belonging to the second category focus on the struggle between an ape and the superior demon-queller, Er-lang. In my opinion, the ancestor archetype of these works is the story "Yang Youji shoots the white ape" in the Qin and Western Han works cited above, and their direct prototype is a Sichuan version of this story represented in the pictorial carvings.

The key to establishing the connection between the Eastern Han Sichuan motif and the later stories about the god Er-lang defeating an ape-spirit lies in the origin and characteristics of Er-lang, the "ape-queller" par excellence in later literary and art works. Important evidence has been provided by Sang Xiuyun. She discovered that Er-lang was originally a hunting deity worshiped by the Qiang people in western Sichuan for his control over mountain ghosts. Such a divine nature allowed the later development of the Er-lang legend, in which Er-lang is transformed into the embodiment of a protective power and integrated with various other "demon-quellers." The original hunting god merged with a third century Sichuan hero, Li Bing, who was worshipped by local people for his defeat of a water demon, thereby controlling the frequent floods that had plagued the region. Er-lang was also identified as the son of Li Bing, or as a Sui dynasty Sichuan officer named Zhao Yu, whose major achievement was, like Li Bing, to overcome a water demon. The Er-lang cult became even more popular in Sichuan under the patronage of the Later Shu emperor, Meng Chang (r. 934-65), and in 965, when the Song dynasty conquered the kingdom, it

---

53 Ling Mengchu (editor), *Chuke paian jingqi* (拙刻拍案驚奇), Shanghai, 1957, pp. 447-464.
adopted the cult, erecting temples for the god in the capital and throughout the country.

When the Er-lang cult became increasingly popular in Sichuan, the previous divine archers such as Yang Youji and Yi, (like many other legendary demon-quellers), were homologized into this new cult, and their defeat of an ape demon became an important part of the Er-lang legend. Er-lang’s traits in later stories and art works clearly disclose this transformation.

Scholars have identified the subject matter of a group of “demon quelling” paintings as the story of Er-lang. The earliest piece can be dated to the Song or Yuan dynasty. Repeating the same narrative format, these works represent Er-lang with his troop, battling a dragon, defeating a water buffalo, and slaying and capturing various ghosts in mountains and forests, including snakes, foxes, tigers, boars, and in particular, a large number of monkeys. Er-lang is depicted in these paintings as a young general commanding the battle, and his adjutants stand behind him and carry his weapon, a divine bow. We see that some of his soldiers present a bound ape as an important capture (Fig.9), while others chase and shoot women who have simian hands and feet and some of whom hold baby apes (Fig.10-11)! Significantly, according to textual data, paintings of this group were first created by Sichuan artists, and were thus

---


57 According to Pao-ch’en Ch’en’s opinion, the version in the Steven Junkunc Collection can be dated to the Southern Song, and that in the Palace Museum, Beijing, to a period from Song to Yuan. Pao-ch’en Ch’en, op. cit., pp. 323–324.

58 According to Guo Ruoxi’s 郭若虛 Tuhua jianwen zhi 圖畫見聞志, scholars have considered that the story of Er-lang’s search for mountain demons was first illustrated by Gao Yi 高益, who worked in the Northern Song capital, Kaifeng, in the tenth century. However, Xuan-he Hua Pu 宣和畫譜 records that the famous Sichuan painter Huang Quan 黃荃 had painted a scroll called “Soushan Tianwang xiang” 搜山天王像 about several decades earlier than Gao Yi. (According to my knowledge, this piece of information was first discovered by C. Hinton and
possibly associated with the old “ape-shooting” motif represented in the Eastern Han carvings.

The anonymous Yuan-Ming play, entitled “Er-lang Shen suo Qitian Dasheng” (二郎神鎖齊天大聖, The god Er-lang locks up the ape-demon “Great Sage-Equal to Heaven”), developed also from the traditional opposition between a demon-queller and an ape. It begins with an ape-demon stealing Taoist elixir and fairy wine. The theft reported, Er-lang is summoned to capture him. Mastering his troops, the demon-queller effects the capture and surrenders the ape. 59

The same theme was further combined with other stories, and became episodes in Ming supernatural novels such as the Feng Shen Yan Yi 封神演義 and various versions of The Journey to the West. In the former, Er-lang succeeds in defeating the Seven Spirits of the Plum Mountain who are led by a white ape with the appellation Yuan Hong 袁洪, or Ape Hong. 60 In the latter, the rebellious mon-

---

Fig. 10 (reprinted from Wen Fong (1984), pl. 328)

Fig. 11 (reprinted from Wen Fong (1984), pl. 328)
key, Sun Wukong 孙悟空, is depicted as invincible except when he encounters Er-lang. In the beginning, the novel describes the monkey’s defeats of the Dragon Kings, the Four Great Devarajas and more than hundreds of other heavenly deities. Even Devaraja Li himself and his son, the ever-victorious Prince Nata, suffered setbacks from the monkey’s prowess. Finally, when the Jade Emperor, the ruler of Heaven, was at his wit’s end, the Bodhisattva Guanyin came to his court to give him counsel:

Your Majesty, let not your mind be troubled! I will recommend a god who can capture the monkey . . . He is the Immortal Master of Illustrious Sagacity Er-lang, who is living at the mouth of the River of Libations in Guan 湒 Prefecture [in Sichuan] and enjoying the incense and oblations offered to him from the Region below.61

A modern reader will predict the result of the battle between the monkey king and Er-lang, since the history of the plot has already determined the superiority of the latter in the dramatic conflict. What may amaze us here is that it is Er-lang’s divine dog who ultimately captures the monkey king—a detail which again leads us back to an old Sichuan belief during the Eastern Han.

Some scholars have attempted to link the two types of ape stories by suggesting that the monkey king in The Journey to the West was based on the “women-abducting” ape as in the prior Tang “White Ape Tale.”63 Other scholars, such as Dudbridge and Anthony Yu, however, emphasize the divergent features of these two traditions, and argue that the inconsistency in character between the two images and the different narrative plots of the Tang and Ming works make such an assumption seem dubious.64 The present study approaches the problem by analyzing both literary and pictorial data, and reaches a different and more complicated understanding regarding the development and interrelationship of these two themes.

According to this study, the two themes, “an ape abducting women” and “Er-lang defeating the ape,” have distinct origins; their archetypes can be found in different pre-Eastern Han texts, such as

62 Ibid., p. 164. The episode is especially prominent in the “Xi You Ji” section of the Si You Ji 四遊記, which is commonly believed to be a reduced version of Wu Chang’en’s Xi You Ji.
Lu Shi Chun Qiu, Forest of the Changes, and Huainan-zi, in forms of brief comments or analogous evidence of metaphysical arguments. The theme, "an ape abducting women," is more likely to have originated from Sichuan, and its most advanced pre-Tang expression is preserved in Sichuan funerary carvings. The prototype of the other, known as "Yang Youji shooting the white ape," may have spread from other parts of China into Sichuan during the Han and also appeared in mortuary art. In the context of Sichuan culture, this motif was further localized; an indigenous deity Er-lang took over the role of the previous divine archers and became the queller of the ape-demon. When this theme took root in Sichuan, the boundary between it and the indigenous theme, "an ape seizing women," began to blur.

These two themes again spread into other parts of China after Eastern Han. Each of the repeated political unifications, especially those of the Wei-Jin, Sui-Tang, and Song-Yuan periods, left their mark on the diffusion of the ape stories, as Sichuan culture was absorbed into Chinese culture at large. The Sichuan ape motifs provide the fodder for the Six Dynasties "records of anomalies," Tang prose fictions, and of Song-Yuan "supernatural" paintings and drama-plays. Once removed from indigenous cultural context, the ritual significance was largely eliminated, while fictional elaboration was increasingly added to the original simple narrative "kernels." The further mingling of these two themes became evident in this evolutionary process, and it is sometimes even difficult to distinguish the two.65 This transformation culminates in the appearance of a new, heroic ape in Wu Cheng’en’s The Journey to the West. This new image has become overwhelmingly dominant in Chinese societies and laid a new base for the development of the ape theme in literature and art during the past three centuries.

65 For example, an early version of Xi You Ji, attributed to Yang Jingxian 杨景贤 of the late Yuan and early Ming, appeared as a combination of the two types of ape stories and contains both the motif of the monkey abducting a princess and that of his surrender to heavenly deities. Shibun 斯文, 9, 1–10, 3 (1927–1928). For dating and attribution, cf., Sun Kaidi 孙楷第, "Wu Changling yu zaju Xiyouji" 吳昌齡與雜劇西遊記, in Gang Zhou Ji 滄州集, Beijing, 1965, vol. 2, pp. 366–398; G. Dudbridge, op. cit., pp. 75–89.